**PERSONAL IDENTITY.**

1. In normal situations it isn’t difficult to tell whether someone is the same persona to one time as at another. But to begin to think about what it is that makes us the same, have a look at the following more unusual scenarios in which it may be less obvious.
2. Read though each scenario and answer the question at the end. Once you have finished, look back over the scenarios and ask yourselves why you chose as you did. What reasons underlie your decisions? In other words, what principle or criterion informed your choice?
3. Take note of all criteria that occur to you.
4. Laura married Rafa when they were both very young. In those days Rafa was handsome, witty and charming. Above all he was always extremely considerate of others and would never raise his voice in anger. Now, however, he has grown ugly, and has nothing of interest to say. He is loud and aggressive and is concerned only with himself. Laura despairs of her lot and wants a divorce. “This is not the same man that I married” she said.

It is the same person that Laura married?

1. Karl is a peaceable old man living in Hanover. He is a committed liberal-democrat with no sympathy for the Nazi regime or its ideology. Nonetheless one day eh is arrested for war crimes committed during the Nazi occupation of Poland. The documentary evidence shows that, as a young man, he did commit these crimes and he is found guilty. Sitting in jail contemplating his fate, Karl is horrified by the thought of the actions in question. He can barely remember performing them, and has no comprehension of what could have motivated the young man to do them.

Is Karl the same person who committed the war crime?

1. Vanesa is very interested in “new age” healing methods. One day she decides to undergo hypnosis to see who she was in her past life. Under hypnosis, memories of the life of a great queen come flooding back. She remembers bathing in asses’ milk falling in love with Mark Anthony and many other wonderful adventures ruling over Egypt. These memories are as real to her as the memories of her present life as a traffic warden in Lebrija. She is convinced that she is the reincarnation of Queen Cleopatra.

Are Vanesa and Cleopatra the same person?

1. Twin brothers Alejandro and José Antonio are crossing the road when they are involved in a terrible accident. Poor Alejandro’s body is badly squashed, but luckily his brain remains virtually unscathed inside his skull. José Antonio is killed outright in the incident but, other than serious brain damage, his body hasn’t a mark on it. The two are rushed to hospital where a (crazed) surgeon decides that the bet option in the circumstances is to transplant Alejandro’s brain into Jose Antonio’s body. The operation is a great success. The next morning the patient wakes up.

Who is the patient?

1. Manuel is happily married with three fine children. One day he goes to work but never returns. His family is devastated. Ten years on, his wife Paula and the children happen to take a trip to Port Aventura. Suddenly to Paula’s amazement she spots Manuel in the crowd. She rushes up to him saying, ”Manuel, where have you been all these years? I’ve been worried sick!”, The man explains that he has no knowledge of any “Manuel”, that he calls himself Alberto and that he has no memories of any life prior to one day ten years ago when he found himself lost in Barcelona with a bump on his head. Since then he has got married and is living happily with three fine children.

Is Alberto the same person as Manuel?

1. Absent-minded genius, Dr Jekyll often works late in his lab concocting potions in a vain effort to cure all known diseases. Late one particularly frustrating night, Jekyll confuses his bedtime hot cocoa for one of his vile potions and drinks several gulps. By the time he realizes his mistake it’s too late and he is already turning into a rabid monster, He runs out of his lab and into the street where he commits several hideous crimes. The next morning Jekyll wakes up in bed with no memory of the night’s events.

Did Jekyll commit the crimes?

**PERSONS. BODY AND MIND.**

1. **Experimenting with Ideas**.
2. Suppose that a device were invented which could record and store the entire contents of someone’s brain. Such a device might be used to safeguard your memories just in case you were to suffer amnesia, in which case they could be downloaded once more onto your brain. Imagine now that you suffer an accident in which you lose much or all information stored in your brain, and that you have this information restored to you via the device.

Would you be the same person?

1. Now suppose that you didn’t physically survive the accident but that device was used to download the information from your brain onto someone else’s brain.

Would you have survived?

1. **Activity.**

Imagine that a 17-year-old called Raul, studying for his 1º Bachillerato exams, goes to sleep in his bed as normal. That night there is a freak electric storm and something funny happens to Raul’s brain. His entire set of memories is erased and they are replaced with the entire set of memories of the football legend Ronaldo who died that night. All the games, the girlfriends, the battles with the press, and so on, are mysteriously etched on Raul’s brain while he sleeps.

Who is the person who wakes up?

1. Raul
2. Ronaldo
3. Someone new

To help answer this question consider some of the following:

* Would the person be shocked when they looked in the mirror?
* Who would the new person think they are?
* Raul didn’t like coffee, whereas Ronaldo drinks a lot of coffee. How many cups would this person drink the first day and would they like the taste?
* Who would Raul’s family think the person is?
* Would the new person want to live with Raul’s family or Ronaldo’s ‘
* Would Raul’s family happily let him leave?
* Would Ronaldo’s family happily welcome him in?
* Would the person be able to convince anyone that he was Ronaldo?
* Would the person be substantially better at football than before’
* Would Ronaldo’s wife love the new person, as a person (ignoring the physical aspects)?
* If you think that the person is no longer Raul, does that mean you believe that memory is the key to the psychological continuity of the person.

G. Jones, J. Hayward, D. Cardinal: *AQA. An introduction to Phylosophy for AS level*.

p. 212-213.